

Life and Religion in the Middle Ages

Edited by

Flocel Sabaté

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing



Life and Religion in the Middle Ages

Edited by Flocel Sabaté

This book first published 2015

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2015 by Flocel Sabaté and contributors

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-4438-7790-5

ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-7790-9

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Religious Experience, a Mirror of Medieval Society	1
Flocel Sabaté	
Building an Identity: King Desiderius, the Abbey of Leno (Brescia), and the Relics of St. Benedict (8 th Century)	15
Maria Chiara Succurro	
The Bishopric of Urgell in the Second Half of the 11 th Century: Jurisdiction, <i>Convenientiae</i> , Simony	34
Jaume Camats Campabadal	
Peculiarities of the Bishopric of Urgell in the 10 th and 11 th Centuries	49
Fernando Arnó-García de la Barrera	
The Ecclesiastical Policy of the Counts of Barcelona in a Conquered Region: The Relationship between the Counts and the Archbishopric of Tarragona in the 12 th and 13 th Centuries.....	67
Toshihiro Abe	
The Crisis of Power: Otto IV, Kings of León-Castile, the Cistercian Order.....	103
Francesco Renzi	
A Crusader without a Sword: The Sources relating to the Blessed Gerard.....	125
Giuseppe Perta	
The Military Orders in Latium	140
Nadia Bagnarini	
Saint Louis and Llull's "Plan" for the Crusade in the Western Mediterranean: <i>modo bellandi et modo convertendi</i>	163
José Higuera Rubio	

An Episcopal Monastery in Florence from the 11 th to the Early 13 th Century: San Miniato al Monte	184
Maria Pia Contessa	
Religious Orders and Cities in Medieval Tuscany (10 th to 14 th Centuries)	202
Francesco Salvestrini	
Female Monasteries in Venice: Religious Dynamics and Political Power	219
Silvia Carraro and Anna Rapetti	
The Cathedral Chapter of Barcelona and the Urban Elites at the End of the 15 th Century	234
Julia Conesa Soriano	
Compline and its Processions in the Context of Castilian Dominican Nunneries	246
Mercedes Pérez	
Devotion and Evangelisation in two Fresco Cycles in the Franciscan Convent of La Verna at the Turn of the 15 th Century	278
Nicoletta Baldini	
Women's Standing in Society and the Family as seen in an Example of Late-Gothic Secular Sculpture	293
Antònia Juan	
Crying Tears, Tearing Clothes: Expressing Grief and Rage in the Middle Ages	305
Ana del Campo	
John Hunyadi and the Late Crusade	327
Andrei Pogăciaș	
War and Peace between the Crown of Castile and Granada: Duality or Interconnectedness?	335
Yuga Kuroda	
Les enjeux du <i>Libro Verde de Aragón</i>	363
Monique Combescure	

SAINT LOUIS AND LLULL'S "PLAN"
FOR THE CRUSADE IN THE WESTERN
MEDITERRANEAN:
MODO BELLANDI ET MODO CONVERTENDI

JOSÉ HIGUERA RUBIO

UNIVERSIDAD COMPLUTENSE DE MADRID

Esdevench-se .i. jorn que.l apostoli ach tramés un cavaller preverequi era del ordre de sciencia cavalleria a .i. rey serray. Aquel per força d'armes vençé .x. cavallers, la .i. après l'altre per diverses diez, e enaprès vençé per rahons tots los savis de sa terra e a tots prová la santa fe católica esser vera. D'aquests benauyrats misages e de molts d'altres inluminava lo mon l'ordenament delmunt dit que.l sant pare havia stablit.¹

Ordinatio (in Catalan *ordonament*) is a legal and political term with a profound theological meaning.² For Ramon Llull, it was the means to

¹ "Once upon a time the Pope sent an ecclesiastical knight, from the chivalry and science order, to a Muslim king, and with his weapons the knight defeated ten Muslim knights, one by one on different days; and then, with his reasoning, he defeated all the wise men in the region, thus clearly proving the truth of the Catholic faith. Thanks to this blessed messenger and others like him the ordination (*ordinatio*) illuminated the world, as had been established by the Holy Father". (Ramon Llull, *Romanç d'Evast e Blanquerna*, ed. by Albert Soler and Joan Santanach (Palma de Mallorca: Patronat Ramon Llull, 2009), p. 358).

² The *ordonament* comes from the theological act of creation, which establishes a hierarchical order in society and politics; for example the act of preaching has the same condition: "Similarly, the *Liber de praedicatione* explains how the preacher must be ordered (*ordinatus*) through good behaviour and saintly living. Taken together, Llull's recommendations seek to render discourse 'orderly' in the widest sense of the word. This comprehensive view of order implies his larger ideal of communication as a relationship of *ordinatio* in the Anselmian sense of a creature's disposition to fulfill its moral finality" (Mark D. Johnston, *The Evangelical Rhetoric of Ramon Llull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), p. 118).

carry out a project of *passagium generale*,³ or crusade. *Ordinatio* means a set of rational rules that should be used in the crusade, applied to a military plan (*modo bellandi*) and to religious conversion (*modo convertendi*). This is a topic that has not yet been treated in depth because of the delicate implications included in the Christian medieval idea of *ius bellum*⁴ in opposition to the attractive multiculturalism underlying the dialogue which Lullian art proposed to the wise men trained in their religious and philosophical traditions.

Specialists in this matter are surprised by the "severity", but also by the mastery, of the treatises in which Ramon Llull exposes the military *ordinatio* of *passagium generale*, especially as, thanks to the studies of war and violence during the Middle Ages, we now understand the difficulty and terrible pain involved in those military expeditions of medieval Christianity. In some cases, this "traumatic" matter is diluted in a brief statement: Ramon Llull expressed a concept that was prevalent in the mood of his time, or simply intended to reflect the ideology which prevailed in his political environment, the dream of conversion or the rhetoric of *recuperatio*.

Compared to this polite means of avoiding the matter's complications, Josep Perarnau⁵ has presented some issues on the legal aspects of these military incursions, since those actions generated political and territorial changes justified by a legal order which extended beyond preaching and theological dialogue. Hence, those aspects appear in Llull, whose great

³ *N'ermitá, es encara altre 'ordonament' | Qui será al 'passatge' molt gran enantiment, | A destruir l'error hon está mante gente; | Que lo papa faés que á son uniment | Venguessos cismátichs, per gran disputament | Del qual bon disputar havem fayt tractament: | E 'ls cismátichs cobrats, qui son mant hòm vivent, | No es hom qui pogués contrastar malament | A l'esgleya, per ferre ne per nuyl argument; | Et del Temple é Espital fós fét uniment, | Et que lur major fós 'Rey del sanct moniment'; | Perque á honrar Deus no say tal tractament* (Ramon Llull, *Obras rimadas*, ed. by Gerónimo Roselló (Palma de Mallorca: Gelabert, 1859), p. 352); This plan was an urgent condition, in Llull's words: *Si autem ista 'ordinatio' praesens in breui tempore non fiat uel alia, quam fecimus hic infra, quae magis generalis est quam ista, timendum est, quod Tartari uel Saraceni acquirant Graecos, et tunc erunt uicini, quod absit Latinis, quia magnum periculum esset* (Ramon Llull, *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest*, ed. by Fernando Dominguez (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), p. 331).

⁴ Jill N. Claster, *Sacred Violence: The European Crusades to the Middle East, 1095-1396* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009), pp. 309 and following.

⁵ Josep Perarnau, "Certeses, hipòtesis i preguntes entorn el tema 'conversió i croada' en Ramon Llull. 'Croada militar' o 'croada gramatical'?", *Arxiu de textos catalans antics*, 25 (2006), p. 484.

assumption is the “transient coexistence” of representatives of different religions who, individually, exchanged the controversial aspects of their traditions through dialogue. From another perspective, those traditions represented powerful territorial interests that were destined to cause altercation. So, those representatives had to decide in their own innermost being whether to abandon the religion they had been educated in, or to agree on a transitional order of political loyalty, favouring trade and financial and cultural exchange.⁶

This paper wishes to offer a new perspective on this complicated issue. Political and military references were a “strategic model” of *passagium generale* in Ramon Llull’s works. That model sought the military defeat of the Muslims in the Holy Land, the Iberian Peninsula and the Maghreb, and envisaged their conversion, and also that of the Jews, through the divided arms of Christendom. That aim of conversion even touched an emergent people in the fight for the Eastern Mediterranean: the Mongols.⁷ My hypothesis is that this strategic model –*ordinatio* in the words of Ramon Llull– was executed largely, and with all its consequences, by King –later Saint– Louis IX of France (according to chronicles of the *Gesta ludovici*).⁸ The characteristics of the *ordinatio* in Llull’s works appear in the two “pilgrimages” made by Saint Louis, the first in 1248 and the second ending with his death in 1270. These pilgrimages introduced, on the one hand, remarkable new military planning, and on the other, the intention of making political treaties that would guarantee Christian preaching in the infidel-occupied territories, as well as a certain religious tolerance for new converts. In relation to this second aspect, Louis IX facilitated a debate between representatives of the Holy Office, assisted by a Jewish convert, and the rabbis of Paris in 1240. The Parisian debate was of compulsory attendance for rabbis, and they were forced to answer the arguments proposed by Odo of Chateauroux (later to be the Pontifical Legate on the expedition to Egypt in 1248). This debate was followed by the preaching of Christian doctrine in the synagogues, on the orders of the King. The attendance at these preaching sessions was compulsory for the Jewish

⁶ Charles E. Dufourcq, *L’Espagne catalane et le Maghrib aux XIIIe et XIVe siècles* (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1966), pp. 104-117.

⁷ Jordi Gayà, “Ramon Llull en Oriente (1301-1302); circunstancias de un viaje”, *Studia Lulliana*, 37 (1997), pp. 25-78.

⁸ *Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, ed. by Martin Bouquet *et alii* (Paris: Palmé, 1738-1904), XX.

community, and it was also obligatory for them to respond to the line of argument they heard "in all honesty".⁹

Louis IX was also significant in the military order for the following reasons: i) he renewed the logistic strategy for the armies which travelled to the East; ii) he opened a new route to the Holy Land in 1270, setting off from Tunisia; iii) he brought about political pacts in the Middle East and sought the conversion of the Khan of Persia; iv) his deeds were recorded in chronicles that quickly integrated his actions with the ideal of the Christian Knight between 1273-1305 (just when Lull's work was in full production).¹⁰ The chronicles described his military achievements, as well as his aim of promoting the conversion of the infidel. Nevertheless, historians do not agree on the missionary goals of Louis IX's expeditions. Regarding this aim, Le Goff says that it cannot be attributed to the peregrinations of Louis IX, since he belonged to a defined echelon of nobility which knew how to achieve salvation, forgiveness for their sins, and how to obtain the category of Christian Knight. Military struggle and obedience to the Pontifical mandate of the crusade were blended into the same task, so it was not necessary to seek the religious conversion of the people they fought. Whatever the case, this was a task for the mendicant orders that accompanied Louis on his expeditions. However, it seems that this was not the only reason for Louis's pilgrimages. Some indications of his intention of approaching the infidels appear in the chronicles. Ceremonies are described representing the conversion of Jews before their military forays;¹¹ Louis sent an ecclesiastical delegation from Cyprus to the Khan of Persia, and maintained a fluid exchange of ambassadors and correspondence with him; his aims are also clear in the chronicles of the attitude towards dialogue that he assumed during his captivity in Egypt.¹²

These interests are due to another type of education in the vernacular for lay people who did not understand Latin. As Ruedi Imbach has shown, that form of education emerged among nobles, knights and merchants during the 13th century independently of universities and religious orders.

⁹ Michael Lower, "Conversion and St Louis's Last Crusade", *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 58 (2007), pp. 211-223.

¹⁰ Jacques Le Goff, *Saint Louis* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2009), mendicant hagiographers, pp. 252-265; foreign chronicles, pp. 341-365; *Vie de Saint Louis. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, pp. 376-398.

¹¹ *In festo beati Dionysii Rex faceret quemdam Judaeum famosum in ipsa ecclesia dicti beati Dionysii solemniter baptizari* (Gaufrido de Belloloco, *Vita sancti ludovici noni. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 22).

¹² Jean of Joinville, *Vie de Saint Louis. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 211.

De eruditione principum, for example, proposed an alternative to education in the service of clerical life, and described the practical and moral judgment that the heirs of a Kingdom should cultivate.¹³ These treatises were followed by editions of encyclopaedias in the vernacular, as well as a consolidated literary production. The heroic deeds of Louis IX and the nobles who accompanied him, and the propaganda about the crusades, were topics for troubadours such as Rutebeuf, who described the French King in the poem *Passage to Tunisia* as an “evangelist, apostle, martyr and confessor”.¹⁴

These verses express how the nobles of the second half of the 13th century sought not only military goals, but also the virtue of martyrdom as evangelisers or apostles, as Ramon Llull describes in his works. The French nobles may well have been aware of the importance of the intellectual debate between faiths to achieve the conversion of the infidels. The chronicles described a captive King (Louis IX) willing to discuss the truth of Christianity with his jailers and non-Christian soldiers in prison.¹⁵

I will now try to show what there is in common in the Lullian *ordinatio* of *passagium generale* and the events of the chronicles of the two expeditions of Louis IX. First, I deal with the logistical planning of the military expedition, or *modo bellandi*, according to the Llull texts, *Liber de passagio* (1292) and *Liber de fine* (1305). Then I turn to the *modo convertendi*, as some of Llull’s texts do not in fact promote the crusade, but try to demonstrate that the requirement to convert and evangelise is a duty that all have received from the authority of Scripture. In the *Doctrina pueril*, Llull quotes John 21.15: Our Lord Jesus Christ gave Saint Peter a three-fold command to “*Tend my sheep*”.¹⁶

The “divine command” marked by the biblical authority established the conversion of the “errant people” (*errats*) or infidels as a priority in the *ordinatio* of the *passagium*. *Ordinatio* here has a legal meaning, since it

¹³ Ruedi Imbach, *Dante, la philosophie et les laïcs: initiations à la philosophie médiévale* (Paris: Éditions du CERF, 1996), pp. 52-55.

¹⁴ *Évangéliste, apostre, martyr et confesseur/ Por Jhésu-Crit soffrient de la mort le presseur* from the poem *Li diz de la voie de Tunez* (Rutebeuf, *Oeuvres complètes de Rutebeuf*, ed. A. Juvenal (Paris: Paul Daffis, 1874), I, p. 161).

¹⁵ Monachos Dionysii, *Gesta sancti ludovici noni, Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 55.

¹⁶ *Nostro señor Deus Jesuchrist a sent Pere con li dix e.l pregá .III. vegades que pasques les sues oveles* (Ramon Llull, *Doctrina pueril* (Palma de Mallorca: Patronat Ramon Llull, 2005), p. 222); *Jeschrist dix en l’Avangeli con dix a sent Pere .iii. vegades qe si li havia amor donás a menjar ses ovelles?* (Ramon Llull, *Romanç d’Evast e Blanquerna*, p. 213).

comes from the medieval conception of natural law. In this way, as Perarnau says, the Imitation of the Apostles shows that Ramon Llull's intentions were pacific and not, by definition, supported by secular arms. Therefore, I will try, as far as possible, to establish a certain distance between military planning and the *modo convertendi*, by way of appeasing the controversy about the importance of intellectual persuasion to achieve the conversion of unbelievers. The discrepancy about the *via rationis* argument is reflected in the Disputation of Paris of 1240, in which the Latin testimony shows us, on the one hand, the obligation of discussion, but also a prejudiced vision of non-Christian texts and religious practices.¹⁷ Sometimes, even Llull echoes these prejudiced interpretations. In spite of this, it is possible to observe the intention of following the *ordinatio* of the *passagium* in the incursions of Louis IX and Ramon Llull in North Africa, following the intellectual and spiritual procedures which seek conversion with a controversial background: the legitimacy of the use of force.

1. *Modo bellandi*

Llull's *Tractatus de modo convertendi infideles*, a second treatise of *Liber de passagio*,¹⁸ is called *De arte bellandi per mare et terras* in some manuscripts. The name is adopted from the French version of the book. Although it was not innovative for its age, Louis IX planned expeditions by land for cavalry and infantry; troops were transported by purpose-built ships. Joinville was surprised by the way the horses disappeared into the holds of the ships,¹⁹ and also by the separation between the ships carrying the ammunition for the campaign and the troop-transporters. The number of troops Luis IX is estimated to have managed to transport to Cyprus in 1248 is 20,000 men and 8,000 horses.²⁰ It is not then surprising that the size of this venture was a model of learning for the Llullian *ordinatio* of the *passagium generale* to the Holy Land.

¹⁷ Isidore Loeb, "La Controverse de 1240 sur le Talmud", *Revue des Etudes juives*, 1 (1880), pp. 247-261; 2 (1881), pp. 248-270; 3 (1881), pp. 39-57.

¹⁸ This work has two treatises: Ramon Llull, *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest*, a letter to the Pope Nicolas IV; and *Tractatus de modo convertendi infideles*, ed. by Fernando Dominguez (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), pp. 255-353.

¹⁹ This kind of ship was called *huissier: spécialement créés pour l'embarquement et le débarquement rapide des chevaux sur les côtes ennemies* (René Bastard, "Navires méditerranéens du temps de Saint Louis", *Revue d'histoire économique et sociale*, 50 (1972), p. 353).

²⁰ Le Goff, *Saint Louis*, pp. 163-185.

1. 1. *Per mare*

Louis IX decided to build a port from which to set off on his expeditions, a place which allowed him to escape the taxes of Marseille and Messina, and avoid his differences with the Catalan-Aragonese Kingdom. This port was named Aigues-mortes²¹ and the ships that the Genoese built for the French King's expeditions were delivered there with some delay. The port is considered the most ambitious military construction of the Middle Ages; it surpassed even the Christian strongholds in Palestine. The voyage to the East made a short stopover in Sicily to pick up grain, and arrived in Cyprus in 1248;²² this was its base for an incursion into Egypt. That route was not unusual, and Ramon Llull speaks of it (1301-1302) and states that he intended to visit the Sultan of Egypt and attempt an incursion against the Khan of Persia.²³ However, he finally said that this route was too long and expensive and rejected it. Much the same occurred with the Rosetta route, and Llull warned of its inconvenience.²⁴ These warnings show Llull's great knowledge of the cost and difficulties of Louis IX's expeditions, but in *De recuperatione*, he says that Armenia was a good place to locate the headquarters of the crusade.²⁵

Another part of the Lullian *ordinatio* is the trade blockade of the North African and Egyptian ports, a strategy that Ramon Llull includes as a condition for the success of his planned crusade.²⁶ This idea is not new

²¹ Jean Combes, "Origine et passé d'Aigues-Mortes", *Revue d'histoire économique et sociale*, 50 (1972), pp. 304-326.

²² *Christiani habent insulas maris, et fortiores quam Saraceni in mari (Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest*, p. 336); *Tertius locus est per mare ire uersus Chipre in Herminiam* (Ramon Llull, *De fine*, ed. A. Madre (Turnhout: Brepols, 1981), p. 276).

²³ [...] *ad fidem catholicam Tartari leuiter acquiri possunt, quia sine lege existunt* (Ramon Llull, *De recuperatione terrae sanctae*, p. 329); *Ego uero fui in partibus ultramarinis, et audiui, quod Cassanus, imperator Tartarorum, pluries dicebat, quod uolebat de fide christianorum esse certus* (Ramon Llull, *De fine*, p. 267; Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, ed. H. Harada (Turnhout: Brepols, 1980), p. 295).

²⁴ *Secundus modus est ire ad quandam insulam, quae Raycet appellatur, quae est prope Alexandriam situata* (Ramon Llull, *De fine*, p. 276).

²⁵ *Et magister istius ordinis cum fratribus suis teneat frontariam in Herminia* (Ramon Llull, *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest*, p. 328).

²⁶ *Et etiam sit prohibitum et uetatum, quod nullus christianus ausus fuerit in Alexandriam uel Syriam mercimonia ire emptum; et esset excommunicatus, quicumque prohibitum pertransiret, et eorum bona, qui hoc praesumerent, caperentur*, *De fine*, p. 281 (Ramon Llull, *Quomodo terra sancta recuperari potest*, p. 328).

either, since Pope Nicolas IV issued a bull in 1289²⁷ inviting the Italian commercial cities to carry it out. A year before the *Liber de passagio* was written, this blockade was once more proposed, and lasted for 10 years.

1. 2. *Per Terra*

When we look at the images that illustrate the Chronicles of Joinville or Guillaume of Saint-Pathus, we can observe the army described by Ramon Lull: the type of weapons, the number of soldiers on foot and horseback.²⁸ *Liber de passagio* emphasises that all troops should voyage by sea, and go ashore just at the target to be attacked,²⁹ a plan executed by Louis IX which had temporary success, because once he left the city of Damietta –re-taken in June 1249– to look for the armies of the Sultan of Babylon, the pilgrimage of the French King ended in defeat and an expensive ransom. Perhaps, warned by this defeat, Ramon Lull states that Christian land armies were at some disadvantage against the Muslims, since the latter refused confrontation and attacked later, when the Christian troops had been decimated by heat, fatigue, thirst and hunger. Therefore, he offers as an alternative the services of Almogavars,³⁰ whose knowledge of tactics and skill with weapons would be a great support for the Christian armies.

That recommendation seems strange, since he omits to mention the Catalan companies, trained in the reconquest of Valencia and Majorca, who provided safekeeping services to the cities in the north of Africa. Those companies were Louis IX's first opponents when he landed in Tunisia in 1270. The trade treaties and the political exchange between the Catalan kings and the Sultan of Tunisia based their prosperity, to some extent, on the highly-regarded services of the Catalan mercenary companies.³¹

Another advantage of attacks by land rather than by sea was the destruction of the sources and supplies of enemy armies. In addition, they

²⁷ Richard Jean, "Le royaume de Chypre et l'embargo sur le commerce avec l'Egypte (fin XIIIe-début XIVE siècle)", *Comptes rendus des séances de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres*, 1 (1984), pp. 120-134.

²⁸ Ramon Lull, *Tractatus de modo convertendi infideles*, p. 340; Ramon Lull, *De fine*, p. 278.

²⁹ Ramon Lull, *De fine*, pp. 278-280.

³⁰ Ramon Lull, *De fine*, p. 278.

³¹ Dufourcq, *L'Espagne catalane et le Maghrib aux XIIIe et XIVE siècles*, pp. 101-104; Gual de Torrella, "Milicias cristianas en Berbería", *Boletín de la Sociedad Arqueológica Luliana*, 34 (1973), pp. 54-63.

provided valuable treasures that could finance the *passagium* to the Holy Land after the occupation.³² At this point, without going into further details, Llull recommended pillaging and looting, as well as attacking coastal cities in order to obtain the resources necessary to support the troops.

1. 3. The Geographical Coincidence

The routes Ramon Llull and Louis IX followed in their forays into the Holy Land and Tunisia were not innovative for the period, as they corresponded to earlier expeditions or previously-known trade routes (see Appendix *map* 1). However, the coincidence between Llull and Louis IX is striking. Both, although for different reasons, established a base in Cyprus³³ for their raids on the East; from Cyprus, they established contact with the military orders, the sultan of Egypt or the Mongols. In Llull's case, he was unsuccessful at establishing those relationships,³⁴ while Louis IX established an exchange of ambassadors with the Mongols.³⁵ Perhaps this success is unsurprising, because Louis was a king, but it is interesting that his "model" was transferred to the *gesta raymundi*.

In the case of Tunisia, the comfortable commercial relations between Catalonia and the Italian cities of North Africa offered favourable ground for Llull's project. Some historians consider that the project was never completed. Although Llull wrote an autobiographical testimony of those

³² Ramon Llull, *De fine*, p. 278.

³³ Guillaume of Nangis, *Gesta sancti ludovici. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, pp. 568-570; Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, p. 295.

³⁴ Mongols are *homens que no an lig* (Ramon Llull, *Doctrina pueril*, p. 72); Ramon Llull, *Romanç d'Evast e Blanquerna*, c. 80, 12, p. 358; Ramon Llull, *De fine*, pp. 266-269; Ramon Llull, *Tractatus de modo convertendi infideles*, p. 345; Ramon Llull, *Liber de acquisitione terrae sanctae*, ed. by E. Kamar, in "Projet de Raymond Lull De acquisitione Terrae Sanctae. Introduction et édition critique du texte", *Collectanea*, 6 (1961), p. 124.

³⁵ *Gesta sancti ludovici noni. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 56; Joinville, *Vie de Saint Louis. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 211: *Quidam vero ardent libidine dominandi, ut Tartari secundum quod imperator eorum dicit unum dominum debere esse in terra sicut unus Deus in coelo, et ille dominus debet ipse esse et constitui, ut patet in epistola quam misit Domino Ludovico regi Franciae, in qua petit ab eo tributum, sicut in libro fratris Gulielmi de moribus Tartarorum continetur, quem librum scripsit praedicto Regi Franciae* (Roger Bacon, *Opus majus*, ed. by J. H. Bridges (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1897), I, p. 368).

trips and the contact with the "wise men", the facts cannot be proven.³⁶ Louis IX's expedition to Tunisia³⁷ also remains an open question for historians. Why did Louis decide to go to Tunisia and not to the Holy Land? Was he attempting to regain the political loyalty of the Sultan with the Kingdom of Sicily and the payment of some debts, or was it true that Al-Muntasir wanted to convert his people to Christianity? The chronicles written after Louis IX's death mention both reasons, and the most striking is the supposed earlier contact with a Tunisian delegation at the christening of a "well-known" Jewish family in Paris.³⁸ On that occasion, the King took advantage of the opportunity to invite the ambassadors and the Sultan to follow the steps of those converts baptised in Saint-Denis.

The coincidence between Llull and Louis IX's routes (map 1) could be the result of comments in various chronicles, of the *gesta ludovici*, in which the mendicant orders, the Benedictines of Saint-Denis and the nobles who accompanied Louis on his expeditions recognised with enormous fervour the "spiritual" reasons that pushed him to re-conquer the Holy Land and convert unbelievers. The publication of Louis's biographies began in 1273 and continued until 1305. There is no doubt that some details of the *gesta ludovici* are to be found in Llull's projects, and were even included in Llull's works.³⁹

2. *Modo convertendi*

2. 1. Roger Bacon and Ramon Llull: *divinas veritates*

The second procedure in the Lullian *ordinatio of passagium generale*, which served also as its basis, was to convert the infidels through theological dialogue with the "wise men", both Muslims and Jews. Llull considered that they were able to explain why Christianity is more valid

³⁶ Raimundus Lullus, *An Introduction*, ed. by Alexander Fidora, Josep E. Rubio *et alii* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008), p. 78; Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, 25, pp. 288-289.

³⁷ Michel Mollat, "'Le Passage' de Saint Louis à Tunis: sa place dans l'histoire des croisades", *Revue d'histoire économique et sociale*, 50 (1972), pp. 289-303.

³⁸ *Vita sancti ludovici noni. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 22; *Gesta sancti ludovici. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 448; *Gesta sancti ludovici noni. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 56.

³⁹ Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, XX, p. 284; XXV, p. 288; XL, p. 299; Ramon Llull, *Disputatio Raimundi christiani et Homeri saraceni*, ed. A. Madre (Turnhout: Brepols, 1998), p. 262.

than the religions professed by their people.⁴⁰ Some Llullian works describe such individual dialogues with wise men, who seem convinced of their tradition and do not allude to the Llullian project, which had been explained in the prologue.⁴¹ In other works, Llull calls for the crusade, and the calm dialogue with the “wise men” disappears. Here Llull shows abundant optimism, as he is convinced he would discover how to persuade the unbelievers through his logic of “necessary reasons”.⁴² He appeals to the intellect to demonstrate the truths of Faith, which would be the first step in the process of abandoning an original religion and accepting another. This issue was common during the 13th century. Thomas of Aquinas was forthright against the intellectual comprehension of faith, because reason defends faith, but cannot prove it.⁴³

However, Ramon Llull intended to go beyond apologist, well-developed evidence based on the intellect. An example of this is a brief story in the book *Blanquerna*⁴⁴ questioning which wise man (chosen from among men of different religions) loves God in the most perfect way. The answer is the man who knows God for what He is in Himself, and by His creation, for Himself and from Himself. This knowledge is represented by Divine actions, the vestiges of which, as Roger Bacon said, divine wisdom had left in the human intellect through natural creation. So, the arguments formed from these truths do not need religious authorities, or miracles, because they are addressed to the intellect. The reasons that prove what God and His operations are –in and from Himself– are common to

⁴⁰ Ramon Llull, *De fine*, p. 256; Ramon Llull, *Romanç d'Evast e Blanquerna*, V, p. 213 ; XIII, p. 358.

⁴¹ Ramon Llull, *Disputatio fidelis et infidelis, Beati Raymundi Lulli Opera*, ed. by F. P. Wolff and J. M. Kurhummel (Magúncia: Häffner, 1729), p. 377; Ramon Llull, *Disputatio Raimundi christiani et Homeri saraceni*, pp. 172-173.

⁴² Ramon Llull, *De modo convertendi infideles*, p. 341; Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, XXVI, p. 290.

⁴³ *Quia tamen quod a summa veritate procedit, falsum esse non potest, nec aliquid necessaria ratione impugnari valet quod falsum non est; sicut fides nostra necessariis rationibus probari non potest, quia humanam mentem excedit, ita improbari necessaria ratione non potest propter sui veritatem. Ad hoc igitur debet tendere Christiani disputatonis intentio in articulis fidei, non ut fidem probet, sed ut fidem defendat: unde et beatus Petrus non dicit: 'parati semper' ad probationem, sed 'ad satisfactionem', ut scilicet rationabiliter ostendatur non esse falsum quod fides Catholica confitetur* (Thomas of Aquinas, *De rationibus Fidei*, ed. by Ludwig Hagemann and Reinhold Gleib (Altenberge: CIS Verlag, 1987), p. 2).

⁴⁴ Ramon Llull, *Romanç d'Evast e Blanquerna*, pp. 377-379.

philosophy and theology, as Bacon⁴⁵ stated in the *Opus majus*, and establish an agreement between the faithful and the infidels. Those passages seem to be a source of the *Doctrina pueril* when Ramon Llull states:

*No som en temps de miracles, cor la devoció era major de convertir lo mon en los apostols que no es ara en lo temps en que som; ne rahons fundades sobre actoritats no reben los infaels. Doncs, covinent es a convertir los infaels ab lo Libre de demostracions e la Art de trobar veritat, la qual los sia mostrada per tal que ab ela los combata hom lur intelligencia, per so que coneguen e amen Deu.*⁴⁶

Beyond the means of converting the infidels through a dialogue based on necessary reasons (Llull) or divine truths (Bacon), what invites evangelisation, martyrdom and the imitation of the Apostles' lives⁴⁷ is the explicit command in the Holy Scriptures. This command has an implicit condition: contact with people of different languages and customs. The crusaders and mendicant orders demanded the learning of languages other than Latin: Greek, Arabic, Hebrew and also the language of the Tartars. In his report about the recovery of the Holy Land, Pierre Dubois⁴⁸

⁴⁵ *Sed non possumus hic arguere per legem nostram, nec per auctoritates Sanctorum, quia infideles negant Christum Dominum et legem suam et sanctos. Quapropter oportet quaerere rationes per alteram viam, et haec est communis nobis et infidelibus, scilicet philosophia. Sed potestas philosophiae in hac parte maxime convenit cum sapientia Dei, immo est vestigium sapientiae divinae datum a Deo homini, ut per hoc vestigium excitetur ad divinas veritates. Nec ista sunt propria philosophiae sed communia theologiae et philosophiae, fidelibus et infidelibus, a Deo data et revelata a philosophis, quatenus genus humanum praeparetur ad divinas veritates speciales* (Roger Bacon, *Opus majus*, I, p. 373).

⁴⁶ "These are not times for miracles, because devotion was greater in the apostles' world than nowadays; not even the reasons founded on authorities convince the infidels. So, it is fitting to convert the unbelievers through the *Book of demonstrations* and the *Art of finding the truth*, which will be demonstrated by the man who fights with his intelligence, and so the unbelievers will know and love God" (Ramon Llull, *Doctrina pueril*, p. 225).

⁴⁷ [...] *que no duptás a sostenir los trebays que hom ha per apendra lur lenguatge ne tamés lo peril de la mort. E per lo convertiment que hom faria en aquels per vertut de martiri, e cor els son ja en openió que Mafumet no es missatge de Deu, los altres sarrayns convertir-s'ien si veyen que los mayors savis lurs se faessen crestians* (Ramon Llull, *Doctrina Pueril*, LXXI, p. 185; Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, XIX, p. 284; Ramon Llull, *De fine*, p. 254).

⁴⁸ Pierre Dubois, *De recuperatione Terre Sancte : traité de politique générale*, ed. by Charles V. Langlois (Paris: Picard, 1891), p. 48.

emphasises the importance of men who speak other languages in order to establish an educational model in that region, a model that would provide teachings in languages and idiosyncratic matters. In 1248, Pope Innocence IV requested the Chancellor of the University of Paris to choose masters for Arabic teaching. This kind of *studium* was set up in Tunisia, conducted by the order of preachers, and similar places were founded in Murcia, Valencia and Barcelona.⁴⁹ This fact had a great effect on the Lullian *ordinatio* of the crusade. The *Liber de passagio*, *Liber de fine* and the *modo convertendi* have as their first rule the foundation of language schools to train men who imitate the lives of Apostles and can argue with wise men from other religions. This aim seems to be a dialectical exercise close to philosophy, and seeks the conversion of infidels through reason and demonstration or, in other words, “to straighten those who live in error”.

2. 2. The Ambiguity of Interfaith Dispute

It is my opinion that intellectual persuasion through “Divine Truths” has two meanings in the *modo convertendi*. The first is the dialectical selfless exercise of the *Llibre del gentil* and the *Blanquerna* in which there is no particular purpose imposed on the argument. The second meaning is rhetorical, since the arguments seek a predefined and admittedly mandatory goal: conversion. Johnston leaned towards this second meaning, and attributed it to the whole Lullian *ordinatio*. I have also found two of Lull’s texts that support this: the first summons Muslims and Jews to attend preaching sessions on Fridays and Saturdays. Although not mandatory, it also includes a warning: God says that that “whoever is not with me, is against me”.⁵⁰ The second text requires princes and

⁴⁹ Rudolf Brummer, “Ramon Llull und das Studium des Arabischen”, *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie*, 85 (1969), pp. 132-143; Dufourcq, *L’Espagne catalane et le Maghrib aux XIIIe et XIVe siècles*, pp. 106-110.

⁵⁰ *Multi Iudaei et etiam Saraceni sunt subditi christianis, et maxime in Hispania. Et ideo bonum, magnum et uerum est, quod Iudaeis praedicetur in die sabbati, et Saracenis in die ueneris, quia in illis diebus est festum eorum; et quod sermones reducantur ad syllogismum et ad intelligibile, secundum quod patet in prima, secunda | et tertia distinctione. Et si talis praedicatio sit perpetua, necessario sequeretur quod tales Iudaei et Saraceni uenirent ad uiam ueritatis, quia intellectus magis se delectat et se impregnatur per intelligere, quam per credere. Ad talem praedicationem autem unum librum feci; et etiam in pluribus, quos feci, est implicata. Qui autem contra talem ordinationem est, habeat aures et audiat uerbum Dei, dicentis: Qui non est me cum, contra me est* (Ramon Llull, *Liber de*

prelates to seek the conversion of infidels, and affirms that if they do not accept the order freely, they would be obliged to do so by the armies of Christendom.⁵¹

Louis IX was undoubtedly responsible for the second meaning of persuasion, since attendance at the Disputation of Paris in 1240 and the subsequent preaching in the synagogues was mandatory, and the attendees had also to answer the questions from the preacher "in all honesty". Perhaps the repetition of that exercise, says Ramon Llull, brings about conversion. Without doubt, this kind of mandatory preaching took place in Saint-Denis as a prologue when Louis IX took the Cross and left for Aigues-mortes.

The ambiguity of these two meanings of persuasion, from my point of view, is not easily solved, since the dispute is disinterested in some of Llull's texts, while other texts imply an *ordinatio*, but both meanings sought conversion. Ramon Llull quotes the case of a monk who failed to convince the Sultan of Tunisia of the truth of the Christian faith. The sultan was dispensed from mandatory conversion, implied in the dialogue with the monk, because there was no power above him that imposed any other goal than mere discussion on him.⁵² Llull's comment on this story, in which he also mentions the name of Louis IX, is curious. If the Sultan refused conversion, there would be a solution: to go to the land of the Saracens and re-conquer the Holy Land, as the French King did. This comment again returns to the ambiguity of the intellectual persuasion of the dialogue based on the "Divine Truths", since there still remained a final secular resource which, nevertheless, participated in the *ordinatio*

ente quod simpliciter est per se et propter se existens et agens, ed. by H. Harada (Turnhout: Brepols, 1980) p. 243).

⁵¹ *Sanctissimus Pater in Christo, dominus papa, et uenerabiles cardinales, archiepiscopi, episcopi et praelati tenentur ex obligatione, ut faciant posse suum, quod pagani necnon Iudaei, infideles etiam alii, fiant christiani, ut possint perpetuo saluari; et si noluerint per disputationem conuenire aut liberam uoluntatem, saltem praedicerentur, et per principes christianorum aut exercitus armis munitos compellantur* (Ramon Llull, *Liber per quem potest cognosci quae lex sit magis bona, magis magna et etiam magis vera*, ed. by A. Soria et alii (Turnhout: Brepols, 1991), p. 180).

⁵² *Et, ideo, si religiosus ille de nostra fide tales dedisset rationes ita cogentes, quod rex non posset soluere ante dictas -quae rationes sunt in sacra pagina implicatae; et sum certus etiam, quod in libris meis supra dictis sunt, ut patet in eisdem- tunc rex fuisset christianus, et una cum eo suae gentes, quoniam sanctus rex Franciae Ludouicus iuit tunc Tunicium cum exercitu suo magno; et si praedictus rex Saracenorum consensisset, tota sua patria fuisset iam fidelis. Et sic recuperata fuisset Terra sancta* (Ramon Llull, *De fine*, pp. 267-268).

that governed Christendom and which could have helped to achieve the apostolic aim of the crusade.

I would like to point out a final text that supports the second meaning of persuasion. In the prologue of the *Dictat de Ramon*, Saint Louis appears together with King James II. Llull imposes a compulsory task on the kings: the religious dispute in the territories governed by the Kings of France and Catalonia. I find it surprising that, almost 20 years after his death, Louis IX was the subject of a dedication in the *ordinatio* by Ramon Llull who, as he says in the text, was en route from Paris in 1299.

*A honor del Sant Spirit | comença e finí son scrit, | Ramon, en vinén de París; | el comana a sant Luys | e al molt noble rey d Aragó, | Jacme, en L Encarnació| de M.CC.XC nou.*⁵³

2. 3. The Two Prisoners, Two Martyrs and Dialogue with the Infidel

Before the capture of Louis IX in Egypt and Ramon Llull in Bugia, Saint Francis of Assisi sought either martyrdom or the conversion of the Sultan Al-Malik. The *Legenda maior*⁵⁴ tells us that Saint Francis asked the Sultan to convert along with his people and offered to walk through flames as proof of his holiness and to demonstrate the power and the glory of God. The Sultan answered that none of his “priests” would be capable of such action to convince others of the truth of their faith. This willingness of Saint Francis awoke the admiration of the Sultan, because he did not know any man so pious as to be capable of such sacrifice. The story begins with a description of the martyrdom that preachers suffered in Morocco or Spain, and the decision of Saint Francis to go to the Holy Land in order to

⁵³ “To the honour of the Holy Ghost | Ramon begins and | ends his text, | in the way to Paris; | he dedicates to Saint Louis | and the very noble James, | King of Aragon, on | the incarnation year | of 1299”. | *Placia ausir est nostre mou, | lo qual havem en disputar| contra Is infaels, e mostrar| de nostra fe la veritat; | e que hi sien li prelat, | Preycadors, frares Menors, | e atressí li grans senyors| qui han enteniment levat: | e sien jueus appellat| e serrayns, al disputar; | e adonchs mostrarem tot clar| que nostra fe es veritat, | e que Is infaels són errat. | E si eu, sènyer, mestre el ver, | placia us quem donets poder| per vostres regnes e comtats, | castells, viles e ciutats, | que Is serrayns faça ajustar, | e los judeus, al disputar| sobr' est novell nostre Dictat* (Ramon Llull, *Dictat de Ramon*, ed. by and Ramon d'Alòs-Moner (Palma de Mallorca: Patronat Ramon Llull, 1936), p. 267).

⁵⁴ Saint Bonaventure, *Legendae S. Francisci Assisiensis saeculis XIII et XIV conscriptae*. V, 10, 5 (Claras Aquas-Florentiae, Quaracchi and Florence: Quaracchi, 1926-1941), pp. 597-601.

convert the Muslims. His journey began –as did the journey of many Crusaders– in the port of Ancona on a boat to Syria in order to meet Al-Malik, the powerful Sultan who was fighting against the Christians (*map 1; fig. 3*).

Llull (*fig. 1*) and Louis IX (*fig. 2*) sought, each in their own way, a similar outcome. That similarity is documented in the iconography that represents this type of contact, seeking the conversion of Muslims (*fig. 3*). The exemplary tales about the preacher or the crusader caused admiration among the captors. It is said that Louis IX baptised his jailers, and that he was admired by his fellow prisoners when he tried to convert non-Christian soldiers to Christianity.⁵⁵ There is also a testimony of martyrdom, as well as a story about the way in which he buried soldiers fallen in battle. So, when the hefty ransom was paid for the French king, he left behind an image of justice and Christian piety among the Muslims, which the chroniclers emphasise in different ways.

Ramon Llull's search for martyrdom was reflected in his forays into Tunisia, which were described in the *Vita coetanea*,⁵⁶ as well as in the biographical images of *Breviculum*.⁵⁷ Those accounts reflect the consequences for Christians preaching in Muslim lands. However, as Saint Francis knew, that was the risk taken by those who sought to convert infidels. The difference between Llull and his predecessors was the use of intellectual arguments and dialogue through "necessary reasons". In the case of Louis IX and Saint Francis, the missionary goals were an important instrument to arouse admiration for piety and charity; Ramon Llull, however, was looking for conversion through the art that he had invented.

Despite these differences, the scenario in which Llull developed his arguments has important similarities with the facts in the accounts of Louis IX or Saint Francis: firstly, the search for the infidels in their own land to convert them; secondly, the physical suffering implied in martyrdom; and thirdly, the admiration that this behaviour awakened among the Muslims. These aspects are represented in the iconography of this type of missionary task, in which scenes of martyrdom and dialogue are repeated as an imaginative reference to these kinds of apostolic facts.

⁵⁵ *Gesta sancti ludovici noni. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 55; Jean of Joinville, *Vie de Saint Louis. Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, p. 248.

⁵⁶ Ramon Llull, *Vita coetanea*, XX, p. 284; XXV, p. 288; XXIX, p. 292; XXXVI, p. 297; Ramon Llull, *Disputatio Raimundi christiani et Homeri saraceni*, p. 262.

⁵⁷ Le Myésier, *Breviculum seu electorium parvum Thomae Migerii*, ed Charles H. Lohr, Theodor Pindl-Büchel *et alii* (Turnhout: Brepols, 1990).

3. Conclusion

In the works Ramon Llull devoted to his crusading project, he includes the name of Louis IX as an example and reference of the role that a Christian King should play in this kind of expedition. He also reproduces the French King's routes to the Holy Land (Egypt and Tunisia), and the material conditions for a military expedition, which he undoubtedly had learnt in the chronicles that described the raids of Louis IX. He even asked for his support, along with that of James II, twenty years after his death. Despite being a literary resource, it shows how important Louis IX was for Ramon Llull.

This fact leads me to formulate the hypothesis that the *bellator rex*, or the ideal Christian King, is Louis IX. Llull describes him in the *Liber de fine*. The common points shown by the historical aspects described in the chronicles, the iconographic depiction and the Llullian *ordinatio* to crusade throughout this article show the arguments which defend this hypothesis. Another reason that leads me to formulate this hypothesis is that the *bellator rex*, according to Llull, must be accompanied by successors, that is, other nobles who would continue his work if he fell in battle. Louis IX went on his expeditions accompanied by much of the French nobility and his direct heirs to the throne, although that did not prevent the failure of the crusade.

In addition to the military aspect, *modo bellandi*, there is the Llullian conversion project, *modo convertendi*. In this respect, the figure of Louis IX is an inspiration to Llull, since he attempted to convert the Mongols so they would assist him in the re-conquest of the Holy Land. The chronicles also describe the conversions of Jews, preaching in the synagogues and sponsorship of controversy with Parisian rabbis. In short, the *ordinatio* of Llull's plan, which was based on the theological agenda of the Middle Ages, was prepared by the Creator in nature, and Louis IX was its epitome.

Appendix



Map 1: **Louis IX:** 1 Aigues-Mortes 1248, 2 Cyprus 1251, 3 Tunis 1270; **Ramon Lull:** 4 Genes 1293, 5 Tunis 1293-1313, 6 Bèjaïa 1307, 7 Cyprus 1301, 8 Damietta 1219.



Figure 1: *Breviculum* (Karlsruhe, codex St. Peter, parch. 92); fig IX, Lull preaching to Saracens in Tunisia 1293; fig. X, Bougie 1307, Lull discussing and prisoner.



Figure 2: Guillaume of Saint-Pathus, *Vie et Miracles de saint Louis*, 1330, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Manuscript, Fr. 5716, 127v; Martyrdom and preaching of Saint Louis.



Figure 3: Florence, Basilica of Santa Croce, Bardi dossal, Saint Francis preaches to the Saracens. Coppo di Marcovaldo 1244.